Boxes and Bullets: Personal and Persuasive Essays

Lucy Calkins, Kelly Boland Hohne, and Cory Gillette

Photography by Peter Cunningham

HEINEMANN ◆ PORTSMOUTH, NH
Acknowledgments  •  iii
Welcome to the Unit  •  vi

**Bend I  Writing to Learn**

1. Essay Structure Boot Camp  •  2
   *In this session, you’ll teach children that writers use an essay frame to help structure their writing. You will give writers a vision for what they are working to create by the end of the unit.*

2. Collecting Ideas as Essayists  •  14
   *In this session, you’ll teach children that writers use several strategies for growing insightful ideas including using important people, places, and objects as inspiration.*

3. Writing to Learn  •  25
   *In this session, you’ll orient children to the genre of writing to learn, helping them see how writers freewrite to grow new ideas.*

4. Using Elaboration Prompts to Grow Ideas  •  35
   *In this session, you’ll teach children that writers linger with their ideas, extending their initial thinking by having conversations with themselves as they write and using elaboration prompts to grow their ideas.*

5. Mining Our Writing  •  46
   *In this session, you’ll teach children that writers mine their entries and their lives for insights, developing these into more fully formed ideas and thesis statements.*

6. Boxes and Bullets: Framing Essays  •  58
   *In this session, you’ll teach children that writers support their thesis by developing different types of reasons.*

7. Return to Boot Camp  •  68
   *In this session, you could teach children that writers focus on both form and content, gathering a variety of evidence to support their opinions as they write within the frame of an essay.*

**Bend II  Raising the Level of Essay Writing**

8. Composing and Sorting Mini-Stories  •  74
   *In this session, you’ll teach children that writers draw on narrative writing and use mini-stories to support the ideas they want to advance.*

9. Creating Parallelism in Lists  •  86
   *In this session, you’ll teach children that writers gather a lot of different material to write their essays, including lists, and they decide which material should go in their essays.*
10. Organizing for Drafting • 94
In this session, you’ll teach children that writers organize for drafting by checking that their evidence is supportive and varied.

11. Building a Cohesive Draft • 104
In this session, you’ll teach children that writers create cohesion with logically sequenced information, transition words, and repeated phrases.

12. Becoming Our Own Job Captains • 112
In this session, you’ll teach children that writers solve their own problems, taking ownership of the writing process by developing their own systems.

13. Writing Introductions and Conclusions • 120
In this session, you’ll teach children the different ways writers commonly open and close essays, and that writers try out multiple leads and conclusions before deciding which work best for their essays.

14. Revising Our Work with Goals in Mind • 128
In this session, you’ll again teach students to self-assess their writing, using the Opinion Writing Checklist. You will support your writers in creating a brand-new, revised draft.

15. Correcting Run-On Sentences and Sentence Fragments • 135
In this session, you could teach students that one thing writers do when they edit their work is correct any run-on sentences or sentence fragments.

BEND III Personal to Persuasive

16. Moving from Personal to Persuasive • 146
In this session, you’ll teach writers to be brave and turn their personal essays into persuasive opinions. You will show them other strategies for generating ideas for persuasive essay writing.

17. Inquiry into Persuasive Essay • 157
In this session, you’ll teach students that writers transfer all they know about one genre of writing to another genre. Writers ask themselves, “What is similar about personal essay writing and persuasive essay writing?”

18. Broader Evidence • 167
In this session, you could teach students that writers draw on evidence from a variety of sources to be more convincing and persuade their audience of their opinion.

19. Connecting Evidence, Reason, and Thesis • 172
In this session, you’ll teach students that writers link their evidence to their reasons and thesis statement so that there are no gaps in their logic or reasoning.

20. Getting Ready to Put Our Opinions into the World • 182
In this session, you’ll teach students that writers get their essays ready for the world by carefully checking their spelling, punctuation, and other conventions.

21. Hey World, Listen Up!: Sharing Our Opinions Loudly and Proudly • 196
In this session, you could teach students that writers think carefully about how (and where) to publish their pieces, making sure their opinions will be heard by their chosen audience.
Welcome to the Unit
and will develop longer pieces across a sustained amount of time, work that pushes them to meet the range-of-writing standard in fourth grade (4.10). And they will learn strategies for each part of the writing process to help them to strengthen their writing with guidance from adults and peers, work that is expected by standard W.4.5.

Yet this unit exceeds the expectations for fourth-grade opinion writing. One of the major shifts in opinion writing from fourth to fifth grade is in the area of logic and organization (W.5.1). Fifth-graders must create pieces that are organized logically as well as provide logically ordered reasons. This expectation pushes fifth-graders to take the first step toward writing arguments, when the logic, relevancy, and sufficiency of the evidence is what matters. This unit directly tackles this critical work, showing students multiple ways to arrange their reasons and evidence and supporting them in seeing that deliberate intention in organization is key to a successful argument.

Boxes and Bullets also works to support students in meeting several key Common Core State Standards in Language for fourth-graders. In addition to supporting multiple conventions of language through editing lessons, the unit also is focused on a key Knowledge of Language Standard, Standard 4.3a, which expects that students will choose words and phrases to convey ideas precisely. This is a standard that the authors of the Common Core have designated as being particularly challenging and one that may require being taught across grades. You will see that this unit repeatedly returns to pushing students to do the work of conveying their ideas precisely. In addition, the unit is focused on supporting students in spelling grade-appropriate words correctly, another key language standard in fourth grade (4.2d), and correcting spelling fragments and run-on sentences (4.1f).

OVERVIEW OF THE UNIT

This unit, like a number of other units in this series, begins with a quick intense immersion into the whole process of writing this new kind of text. The goal for “essay boot camp,” as the opening days of the unit are called, is to help students develop a sense for what it feels like to write a whole essay. The students first work together as a class to construct a simple class essay by “writing-in-the-air” together, and then they go off to flash-draft the spoken essay onto paper.
Then, students will spend the next few days gathering entries in their notebooks, writing long about ideas about people, objects, events, and so on. To raise the level of this work, students will engage in an inquiry into what makes for strong freewriting and will look at mentor examples of this. They will also look back at their previous writing and reflect on ideas lying between the lines and create new writing from this reflection. As the bend ends, students will use what they’ve written in their notebooks to develop thesis statements, and they will build plans for their essays.

In the next bend, or part, of the unit—“Raising the Level of Essay Writing”—students will write out the evidence to support the reasons for their opinion. One option for organizing this evidence is for students to set up folders in which to collect evidence for two of their reasons. They will collect mini-stories to support reasons as well as lists and then organize this evidence by selecting the most powerful and revising it to angle all information to support their reasons. They will construct a draft of these two sections of their essay, using transition words and phrases to create cohesion. Students can then decide on the system that is best for them to develop their third reason. As they take themselves through the process of constructing the third section of their essay, they will also learn to use the introduction of a piece to orient and engage the reader and the conclusion to provide final related thinking. They will self-assess to determine how much they have grown from their on-demand and will revise with goals in mind. Students will correct for clarity, such as finding and correcting run-on sentences and sentence fragments, and share their work in a mini-celebration.

Bend III of the unit, “Personal to Persuasive,” is about transference and raising the quality of work. Students will develop persuasive opinions that are more generalized and develop a plan for a persuasive essay. They will then be charged with taking themselves through the process of developing and drafting this essay with greater independence, transferring and applying all they have learned and all the resources, tools, charts, and so on at hand. They will learn to include a greater variety of evidence, such as outside evidence, and revise not only this current piece but all of their essays by elaborating on how that evidence connects to their reason and opinion. They will again self-assess, reflecting on their growth across the unit and setting future goals. Students will edit using all they have learned about conventions and, in particular, ensure that all grade-appropriate words are spelled correctly. They will publish their pieces in a final celebration.

**ASSESSMENT**

Prior to launching the unit, you will want to assess your students’ grasp of opinion writing. One way to do so is to ask students to write in response to an opinion prompt. We recommend the following prompt, found in the *Writing Pathways: Performance Assessments and Learning Progressions, K–5* book:

“Think of a topic or issue that you know and care about, an issue around which you have strong feelings. Tomorrow, you will have forty-five minutes to write an opinion or argument text in which you will write your opinion or claim and tell reasons why you feel that way. When you do this, draw on everything you know about essays, persuasive letters, and reviews. If you want to find and use information from a book or another outside source, you may bring that with you tomorrow. Please keep in mind that you’ll have forty-five minutes to complete this, so you will need to plan, draft, revise, and edit in one sitting. In your writing, make sure you:

- Write an introduction
- State your opinion or claim
- Give reasons and evidence
- Organize your writing
- Acknowledge counterclaims
- Use transition words
- Write a conclusion”

This on-demand task will give you vital information about students’ current strengths in terms of their knowledge of persuasive writing as a genre—its purpose, craft, and structure. You and your students will be able to assess these on-demand pieces against a checklist, or students can lay them out and describe to each other what they already know how to do as writers that they’ll carry into this unit. The Opinion/Argument Writing Learning Progression can guide your assessment of this work. You can look at the rubric for fourth grade, noting which students meet grade level expectations (a level 4 on the rubric) and which students fall below (levels 3 and 2) or exceed (level 5) expectations.

We suggest gathering with your grade team, each of you bringing pieces of writing that represent the levels found in your classrooms. Then, as a grade level team, you can create a set of pieces representative of each level. Assigning an exact level for each student is not as important as the conversations you have about the work, which will enable you to align your vision
as a grade. With this anchor set of papers, you can then go back to quickly assess the rest of your students’ work. All of this information will help you plan predictable small groups for your advanced writers as well as those who need extra support.

In addition, the Opinion/Argument Writing Learning Progression can offer next steps for teaching, and the checklists that align to the progression can help your students to self-assess, set goals, and develop action plans. You will see that across the unit, there are opportunities for students to check their own progress, holding their pieces against the checklist, asking, “How am I getting better? What can I do to push myself to get even stronger?”

You will see that this unit essentially teaches students two types of writing—the analytical freewriting that is the work of the first bend and then the more formal essays. Because of this, the Opinion/Argument Writing Learning Progression is not incorporated as much in the first bend as it is in the first bends of other units of study. Asking students to assess their freewriting by looking for qualities of effective opinion writing would not be helpful to them because freewriting is not expected to have these qualities! Instead, you will see that the third session supports students in doing an inquiry into what makes for effective freewriting, which is itself an assessment because they will take what they are noticing and apply it to their work.

Once the students have developed a draft, they will assess this draft with the Opinion/Argument Writing Checklist. Students will be asked to write quick essays for homework at a few points across the unit and to assess these as well as their longer published pieces. We have noted places where this homework is particularly important because students will spend the first part of the next day assessing this work in class.

The checklists students will use have two columns—one for grade 4 expectations and one for grade 5 expectations. This checklist is meant to be a tool to hold them accountable, not to teach them new work, so you will see that many lessons teach toward meeting fifth-grade standards. Another reason for the double-column checklist is that you may have students who are already meeting some expectations for fifth grade, and by giving them this checklist, you are helping to meet the needs of the range of learners in your room. (Of course, this means that some of your learners may also need to revisit the checklist for third-grade opinion writing, but you won’t want to settle for that level of work!) All of this information will help you plan predictable small groups for your advanced writers as well as those who need extra support.

At the end of the unit, you’ll probably give the performance assessment again. You can give the same task on a different topic with a different text set. We’ve found, though, that there is something very powerful for children in doing it again, with the same texts, and then laying their two pieces alongside each other and marking them up, annotating them, and showing off their new skills. It’s easier to see the new work when the research was the same.

GETTING READY

Getting ready for this unit mainly involves gathering your own demonstration writing. Across this unit we have provided samples of demonstration writing that you could use, but your teaching will be more effective if students see you engaged in this process alongside them. Thus, before the unit starts, we highly encourage you to sit with your grade team, one of you taking the role of teacher, and work through the teaching points of the lessons quickly, doing your own writing. The writing you gather can thread through all of your lessons, but more importantly, you will get a sense of the work of the unit, including the challenges of the unit and how you can better support your students through these. To be responsive on the spot to what students need, as models of teacher effectiveness are calling for, each teacher needs a sense of the pathway of learning. Doing your own writing can help provide that sense of the pathway and will allow you to make choices about how to help all of your learners along that pathway.
Before you embark on today’s session, you will definitely want to have a thesis in mind so you can write your own essay along with your students. Unless you try your hand at this work, you won’t grasp why and how it is challenging. To an outsider, the process described in this book may look simple, but it’s vastly more complicated and more interesting than it appears from a distance.

Today’s work is foundational for the writing students will do for the bulk of this unit and different in key ways from the opinion writing work in which students engaged in previous years. Last year your students came up with categories to support their claims, which were not necessarily parallel or totally distinct. And writers did not have those categories in mind from the start.

Your goal today will be to help your children imagine several alternative plans or outlines for an essay. You will teach children that essayists sometimes support their thesis statements by providing reasons for a claim, sometimes by offering times when the claim is true, and sometimes by explaining different ways in which a claim is true. Students will begin with their theses and then mull over the smaller points they want to make. Will they support the claim by providing reasons? Times? Ways?

If you look closely at what your children do in response to today’s teaching, you’ll find that this work is more challenging than you ever imagined—and hence it will present you with lots of teaching and learning opportunities. Your students won’t produce a lot of work, but the work they do produce will be worth hours of study on your part—and lots of responsive instruction. Because today’s session involves foundational work, it is especially important for you to devote time to helping each individual develop a credible essay plan.

For this reason, as well as others, the work children do during today’s session will spill over into tomorrow, giving you more time to work with individual writers.

This session will not follow the usual pattern of a writing workshop. At the start of the minilesson, let children know that the schedule and format for today will be unusual. You needn’t explain the details to them, but it is important that you realize that children will write while sitting in the meeting area, and your conferring and small-group work will

**Common Core State Standards:** W.4.1.a, b; W.4.5, RI.4.2, RL.4.3, SL.4.1, L.4.1, L.4.2, L.4.3
happen as they sit around you in that space. This responsive teaching will be important. If children leave today with some workable plans for essays, the work over the upcoming days will all click into place, but if you only reach a third of the class, chances are good that the infrastructure of many essays will need to be addressed soon. Today, then, you’ll definitely want to move quickly from child to child, helping them explore and learn from the writing that emerges on their pages. You will be helping each child draft and revise what will amount to a frame—an outline—for an essay. Children will learn not only to write a thesis, but also to rewrite it, and they’ll do this countless times over. The revision work will teach lessons in logic and cohesion, which means children won’t be doing the usual sort of revision—reaching for sensory details or questioning whether a text is focused. Instead, the revision will revolve around thinking about the relationship between theses, reasons, and evidence. All of your students’ revision will culminate in a grand total of about thirty words. I promise that although the products may not seem as luscious as other writing you’ve seen across this series, the lessons in logic and language that you and your children can learn through this work are crucial and long lasting.

Tonight’s homework will be especially important as you will ask your writers to do another on-demand, giving themselves forty-five or fifty minutes to produce a quick essay. Tomorrow you will involve your writers in self-assessment and revision of those on-demands, so tonight’s work is critical for tomorrow.

Because today’s session involves foundational work, it is especially important for you to devote time to helping each individual develop a credible essay plan.
Restate the cake metaphor, rallying children for the work of planning out the essay frames for their claims.

“Writers, I hope that right now each of you has a thesis that you feel fired up about, one that you can hold in your two hands like this.” I showed the children how I had jotted my thesis in a box on the top of a clean sheet of notebook paper. “Take one minute and write that thesis on the card in front of you just like I did.” I gave them a few minutes to scribble. “Hold them up!” I said, as I made a big deal of looking across the rug. Then I motioned for the students to lower their cards.

“Writers, today marks a big day in our unit. Today, you will start to plan out your essays. This means that you will be thinking about both the content of your essays, that is, your big ideas, and the structure of your essays. This is challenging. It will be kind of like you are making a big cake and you have to make a cake that looks beautiful in form and tastes amazing, too! You have to keep structure and content in mind at the same time.”

**Name the teaching point.**

“Today, I am going to teach you that one way to make sure that your essays are strong in both form and content is to have a clear plan before you start writing. You can plan by writing your thesis and your reasons to support that thesis, by planning your boxes and bullets.”

**TEACHING**

Demonstrate how you generate reasons for your own thesis, and deliberately model that you weigh and reject some possibilities.

“Essayists back up their claims with reasons. They write, ‘I think this . . . because . . . ’ And here is a key tip: Essayists use different types of reasons to back up their claims. One, their reasons might show when their thesis is true. Two, their reasons might show why their thesis is true. Three, their reasons might show how their thesis is true. Watch me and research how I try out reasons that show when, why, or how my opinion, my claim, is true.”

You’ll see that this connection harkens back to the reference we made earlier about cakes that look lovely but taste awful. You are again rallying your students to balance a focus on form with a focus on content.

I have taught this session using fairly physical props, such as a construction paper “plaque” on which each child writes his or her thesis. When I do that, I’m trying to convey sable messages through the use of materials. The plaque helps children feel as if they’ve made a commitment to a single thesis. The entire rehearsal and entry-gathering phase culminates in the commitment to this one- or two-sentence claim.
It runs against all our training for children to be so repetitive! If you decide to encourage children to word the stem differently each time, know that we tried this too. But we have come to believe that if children don’t repeat their stem (at least during this unit of study), they end up with categories (bullets) that aren’t cohesive. This disjunction becomes increasingly problematic when the main idea is elaborated upon in an entire paragraph that also doesn’t align. I strongly recommend that you stop worrying that the topic sentences will be dull if children repeat the stem.

In this unit, the work you do in response to kids’ efforts will be especially important because the intellectual work of the unit has everything to do with muddling through the hard parts. So insert yourself into partner conversations and listen for what you can support and teach. You may find that you need to convene the whole class’ attention several times, intervening to lift the level of children’s work during the prolonged active engagement. For example, often a close look will reveal that two of the reasons a child has produced are the same, just worded differently—you could mention that now or save it for a later time. Perhaps the child’s points don’t sound aligned—you could adjust them subtly by repeating them, with small tweaks that make the child’s language fall into parallel structure.

So I have my claim: ‘My father is my most important teacher.’” As I said these words, I held up the page on which I had written this in large letters. “Let me look at what I want to put in my essay and see what type of reasons I’m going to provide.” I uncovered my web from the day before and studied it silently for a moment.

“Okay, I want to write about my father making waffles for the people he works with on Christmas and telling me when sailing on the last day of vacation that he couldn’t wait to get back to his job. So maybe my reasons are really showing when my thesis is true, when my father was my most important teacher. So I could say, ‘My father is my most important teacher. My father is my most important teacher when he makes waffles on Christmas. My father is my most important teacher when he takes me sailing. My father is my most important teacher when he gives me advice on writing.’ Is that what I want to say?” I was quiet for a moment and then shook my head.

“No, times don’t work for me. I don’t just want to write about when my father is my most important teacher. I think I want to write about why he is my most important teacher.”

Continue demonstrating the next steps in the process of creating reasons for your opinion statement. Again, deliberately model making mistakes and fixing them.

“Okay, so I want to write about why my father is my most important teacher. That means my reasons need to show why my thesis is true. I’m going to repeat my claim and then say ‘because. . . .’” I dragged out my articulation of the word to imply that more came after it. “First, let me think over all I have already written about what my father has taught me.” I glanced at my web and then closed my eyes briefly, letting the students see me struggle.

“Okay, my father is my most important teacher because. . . . he taught me to love work. My father is my most important teacher because he taught me to love writing. My father is my most important teacher because he took me sailing.” I stopped. “Wait, ‘took me sailing’ doesn’t prove that my father taught me anything. I need to find a third reason that ‘My father is my most important teacher.’ Let me try again. I’ll repeat my claim and then say ‘because.’ My father is my most important teacher because. . . . he taught me that one person can make a difference.” I jotted the three reasons on my chart under the box with my thesis.

My father is my most important teacher.

- My father is my most important teacher because he taught me to love work.
- My father is my most important teacher because he taught me to love writing.
- My father is my most important teacher because he taught me that one person can make a difference.

Debrief by articulating what you did that you hope children will also do.

“Writers, do you see the way I repeated my claim—my thesis—and then said ‘because’ to help me think of reasons to support my claim?”
ACTIVE ENGAGEMENT

Set children up to practice coming up with reasons for their own claims.

“You each have your own thesis statement. In a minute you are going to try supporting your thesis with reasons. Right now, think over all you have written about your claim. Glance back through your notebook if it helps.” I gave them a minute to do this work. “Now, you will practice trying out finding types of reasons that support your claim and that match what you want to say. For now, just practice coming up with one reason that shows why your thesis is true, unless others rush out. First, mentally say your thesis, then say ‘becauuuuse . . . ’, and a reason will pop into your mind right then, as you talk. Do that now.” I gave them a minute to do that work.

“In a minute you will share your thesis and reasons with your partner. Today both of you will get a chance to share. Partner 1, you’ll go first. You’ll state your claim and first reason. Partner 2, listen and give a thumbs up if that reason supports the claim and thumbs down if it doesn’t. Then you can switch roles. Okay, turn and share.” The room erupted into talk.

Emma’s thesis and supporting reasons are shown in Figure 6–1.

LINK

Set writers up to continue to work to develop their own theses and reasons.

“Writers, today is going to be a bit different than usual. Instead of sending you off to work on your own, I’m going to suggest you spend the rest of today’s writing workshop right here because you have work to do that must be done today. By the end of today, you each need to have an opinion statement and three reasons to show why that thesis is true. Right now, sitting here, work to find reasons to support your claim. You want those reasons to match what you want to say. Write a box (your thesis) and bullets (your reasons) in your notebook. Help each other. I’ll be coaching, and I’ll collect your plans at the end of today’s workshop.”

FIG. 6–1 Emma’s thesis and supporting reasons

FIG. 6–2 Rie, trying to grow her first thesis
Today’s Lesson will create some challenges for your writers. These challenges are best addressed through quick one-to-one conferences and small-group strategy lessons. By anticipating the predictable problems, you can be ready for the conferences and small-group work you’ll need to lead today.

Some writers will still need help developing and articulating strong, clear thesis statements. Some will write questions rather than statements. Teach them that instead of writing, “Why do I love my dad so much?” they need to make a stand, to claim a position: “I love my father because he makes me improve myself.” Some children will resist making clear, concise statements and instead hedge their opinions: “One of the reasons why I love my dad is that some of the time he doesn’t let me be anything less than my best, but other times he isn’t like that.” Help writers who hedge to create a lean, clear thesis statement that doesn’t waffle.

Steer children away from a claim that has two branches, as in “My mother and my father are important to me.” That essayist would have to prove that both his mother and his father are important. It is simpler to start with one single claim. Then, too, sometimes a thesis is really making two points, as in this example: “Because children care a lot about their parents, sometimes they are embarrassed by them.” There is nothing wrong with this opinion statement, but defending it poses an extra layer of writing challenge, because now the child needs to show not only that kids can be embarrassed by their parents, but also that this feeling is motivated by care. Later, writers can always address counterarguments or further claims, but for now, help children write straightforward, clean, crisp thesis statements.

Some kids will write a fact in lieu of a thesis or merely name a topic. The child who writes, “My father picks me up after school” has written a fact, not a thesis. I prompt children to go past the fact to an idea by asking, “What are your ideas or your feelings about this?” Soon the child will have a thesis: “I love it when my father picks me up after school.” The child who writes, “My strong opinion is about war” may need practice in simply learning how to state a clear thesis. When I pulled up to confer with
Tanya, I decided to provide guided practice during our conference to make sure my teaching would stick. "Let's practice," I urged her. "I'll name a topic and you say a claim. Cafeteria food. . . ."

“They have chicken nuggets on Thurs—”


Then, too, you can anticipate predictable problems your writers will encounter as they go about creating reasons for a claim. Typically, when writers run into pitfalls in this work, they have created categories that don’t support their claim, overlapping reasons, reasons that are not parallel, and so on. You can anticipate conferences and small-group work that push writers to reconsider their reasons and help them to recognize why the current plan will not support the thesis. I like to show students an example of strong boxes and bullets, such as Sophie’s to help them to see how she made two drafts of her boxes and bullets, with the second more specific than the first.

Here’s Sophie’s first draft of her boxes and bullets (see Figure 6–3).

![FIG. 6–3 Sophie's first draft](image)

Sophie’s second draft is more specific than her first:

![FIG. 6–4 Sophie's second draft](image)

As I crouched among the writers in the meeting area following the lesson, I helped one child after another set up possible frameworks for an essay, and I encouraged nearby children to listen in as I worked with their classmates. I especially helped kids “try on” a variety of optional ways their essays could go. My conversations sounded like this:

“So what is your thesis, Diana?”

“My mom is important to me.”

Although ordinarily I wouldn’t accept something as vague as “My mom is important to me because she is nice,” in this instance I keep in mind that I have asked kids to write big ideas. I have asked for generalizations. Although it is true that even big ideas often become more compelling when they are more specific, it can then be harder to elaborate on them when they are more specific. I don’t necessarily push for more specificity. My goal is to help all kids grasp the concept of an umbrella idea, a claim that is supported by several distinct and parallel subordinate categories (or reasons).

As I work with one child and then another, I am sure to come across the problem that one reason does not support the thesis. When I see this, I often try to showcase the problem by telling the child about another kid whose reasons did not all support the
thesis. “Your list reminds me of this other kid who said, ‘My dog is like a friend because he listens to me, he keeps me company, and he wins dog shows.’" Do you see that the third bullet may be true of my dog, but it doesn’t explain why he is like a best friend?”

When I create examples that I hope will make a point to children, I choose very clear-cut ones. I once said, “I like oranges because they are juicy. I like oranges because they are tasty.” Then, for the third bullet, I said, “I like oranges because one day I saw an orange plant in a rain forest.” That last reason was obvious and dramatic enough that I made my point easily.

One thing I like to do is collect all of the boxes-and-bullets plans on Post-it® notes and tape them on two pages of loose-leaf paper. I stick these in my confering binder so I can see at a glance whose plans will likely lead to an effective essay. I first categorize these by “workable” and “needs help” and then I categorize the “needs help” according to predictable problems and plan to do more small groups like today.

Here are some thesis statements and thesis statements with reasons that illustrate predictable problems you might be seeing. You can use these to support students in noticing these types of problems. You will find other groups of thesis statements with reasons that illustrate predictable problems as well as exemplars—and you can use these for small-group work, confering, homework, and so on—on the CD-ROM.

Problem—Thesis is not personal:

Mars would be a fun place to live.

Problem—Reasons do not support/match the thesis:

My mom is my best friend
• because she is a good cook
• because she dresses well
• because she works hard at her job

Problem—Reasons are not parallel:

My mom is my best friend
• because she buys me things
• now that I am older
• when I am at home

Problem—Thesis is two-pronged. Writer would need to prove both parts and gather reasons to support both:

My dad is my friend and my mentor.

Problem—Fact not a thesis:

My grandmother is old.

Problem—Reasons are overlapping:

My mom is my best friend
• Because she is fun
• Because I have a good time with her
• Because she listens to me
Revising Our Thesis Statements

Share an example of a writer who revised a thesis when it did not match what she wanted to write about in her essay.

“Writers, now that you are developing your reasons for your thesis statements, you’ll get a much clearer sense of what you want to put in your essay and how your essay will go. Sometimes when you think and talk more about your essay, you realize that your original thesis no longer matches what you want to say. When that happens, revise your claim. Sydni’s original thesis was ‘It is difficult being an only child.’ But as she thought about what she wanted to write, she realized that her thesis did not match what she really felt, that being an only child is complicated. On the one hand it is difficult. But on the other hand it feels special. Sydni lucked out. That is also a form that often works for essays; you say that your ideas on whatever the topic is are complicated. Then you say, ‘On the one hand . . .’ and then, ‘On the other hand . . .’ or you could say, ‘I used to think . . . but now I think . . .’”

Have students go back to their plans to see if this strategy might be helpful to them and let them know they will be handing these in to you.

“Right now, check your current plans for your essay. Will you have a lot of evidence to go with your reasons? Does your thesis match what you plan to say about it? If not, you have the option to revise your thesis like Sydni did.

“I am going to collect these plans at the end of the workshop to look at tonight. You have a few more minutes to review your work, then jot down your box-and-bullets and your name on a Post-it and put it in this basket.”

If you believe that children have already revised their thesis statements well enough, you may want to use this share time to again emphasize the importance of building essays with parallel supporting paragraphs. You could list thesis statements and then supporting paragraph ideas, each with one that is off-kilter, so that children can learn to spy the ones that need revision. In addition to the samples in the conferring section, you can find additional predictable problems on the CD-ROM.
SESSION 6 HOMEWORK

BOXES AND BULLETS

Fast and Furious Flash-Drafting

Writers, we are about to start a new bend in our unit. You will be developing your essay. To do this work well, you will want to keep your personal goals right in the front of your minds. Tonight I am asking you to do another on-demand. Set your clock for a half hour or forty minutes and write fast and furiously to support a strong opinion. Bring that piece with you tomorrow because you’ll spend tomorrow assessing your work and reminding yourself of your personal goals as you head into the next part of the unit!